



Human Development Report **2009**

Overcoming barriers:
Human mobility and development



Published for the
United Nations
Development
Programme
(UNDP)

Copyright © 2009
by the United Nations Development Programme
1 UN Plaza, New York, NY 10017, USA

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior permission.

ISBN 978-0-230-23904-3

First published in 2009
by Palgrave Macmillan
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library and the Library of Congress.

Printed in Canada by the Lowe–Martin Group. Cover is printed on FSC 10pt Kallima coated one-side paper. Text pages are printed on FSC 60# Rolland Opaque30 smooth text that is 30% post-consumer waste. FSC supports responsible forest management worldwide. Printed with vegetable-based inks and produced by means of environmentally-compatible technology.



Editing: Green Ink
Design and Layout: ZAGO

For a list of any errors or omissions found subsequent to printing, please visit our website at <http://hdr.undp.org>

Team for the preparation of the Human Development Report 2009

Director

Jeni Klugman

Research

Led by Francisco R. Rodríguez, comprising Ginette Azcona, Matthew Cummins, Ricardo Fuentes Nieva, Mamaye Gebretsadik, Wei Ha, Marieke Kleemans, Emmanuel Letouzé, Roshni Menon, Daniel Ortega, Isabel Medalho Pereira, Mark Purser and Cecilia Ugaz (Deputy Director until October 2008).

Statistics

Led by Alison Kennedy, comprising Liliana Carvajal, Amie Gaye, Shreyasi Jha, Papa Seck and Andrew Thornton.

National HDR and network

Eva Jespersen (Deputy Director HDRO), Mary Ann Mwangi, Paola Pagliani and Timothy Scott.

Outreach and communications

Led by Marisol Sanjines, comprising Wynne Boelt, Jean-Yves Hamel, Melissa Hernandez, Pedro Manuel Moreno and Yolanda Polo.

Production, translation, budget and operations, administration

Carlotta Aiello (production coordinator), Sarantuya Mend (operations manager), Fe Juarez-Shanahan and Oscar Bernal.

Foreword

Migration not infrequently gets a bad press. Negative stereotypes portraying migrants as ‘stealing our jobs’ or ‘scrounging off the taxpayer’ abound in sections of the media and public opinion, especially in times of recession. For others, the word ‘migrant’ may evoke images of people at their most vulnerable. This year’s Human Development Report, *Overcoming Barriers: Human Mobility and Development*, challenges such stereotypes. It seeks to broaden and rebalance perceptions of migration to reflect a more complex and highly variable reality.

This report breaks new ground in applying a human development approach to the study of migration. It discusses who migrants are, where they come from and go to, and why they move. It looks at the multiple impacts of migration for all who are affected by it—not just those who move, but also those who stay.

In so doing, the report’s findings cast new light on some common misconceptions. For example, migration from developing to developed countries accounts for only a minor fraction of human movement. Migration from one developing economy to another is much more common. Most migrants do not go abroad at all, but instead move within their own country.

Next, the majority of migrants, far from being victims, tend to be successful, both before they leave their original home and on arrival in their new one. Outcomes in all aspects of human development, not only income but also education and health, are for the most part positive—some immensely so, with people from the poorest places gaining the most.

Reviewing an extensive literature, the report finds that fears about migrants taking the jobs or lowering the wages of local people, placing an unwelcome burden on local services, or costing the taxpayer money, are generally exaggerated. When migrants’ skills complement those of local people, both groups benefit. Societies as a whole may also benefit in many ways—ranging from rising levels of technical innovation to increasingly diverse cuisine to which migrants contribute.

The report suggests that the policy response to migration can be wanting. Many governments institute increasingly repressive entry regimes, turn a blind eye to health and safety violations by employers, or fail to take a lead in educating the public on the benefits of immigration.

By examining policies with a view to expanding people’s freedoms rather than controlling or restricting human movement, this report proposes a bold set of reforms. It argues that, when tailored to country-specific contexts, these changes can amplify human mobility’s already substantial contributions to human development.

The principal reforms proposed centre around six areas, each of which has important and complementary contributions to make to human development: opening up existing entry channels so that more workers can emigrate; ensuring basic rights for migrants; lowering the transaction costs of migration; finding solutions that benefit both destination communities and the migrants they receive; making it easier for people to move within their own countries; and mainstreaming migration into national development strategies.

The report argues that while many of these reforms are more feasible than at first thought, they nonetheless require political courage. There may also be limits to governments’ ability to make swift policy changes while the recession persists.

This is the first Human Development Report for which as Administrator I am writing the foreword. Like all such reports, this is an independent study intended to stimulate debate and discussion on an important issue. It is not a statement of either United Nations or UNDP policy.

At the same time, by highlighting human mobility as a core component of the human development agenda, it is UNDP's hope that the following insights will add value to ongoing

discourse on migration and inform the work of development practitioners and policy makers around the world.



Helen Clark
Administrator
United Nations Development Programme

The analysis and policy recommendations of this report do not necessarily reflect the views of the United Nations Development Programme, its Executive Board or its Member States.

The report is an independent publication commissioned by UNDP. It is the fruit of a collaborative effort by a team of eminent advisers and the Human Development Report team.

Jeni Klugman, Director of the Human Development Report Office, led the effort.

Acknowledgements

This report is the fruit of the efforts, contributions and support of many people and organizations. I would like to thank Kemal Derviş for the opportunity to take on the daunting task of Director of the Human Development Report, and the new UNDP Administrator, Helen Clark, for advice and support. Coming back to the office after its 20 years of growth and success has been a tremendously rewarding experience, and I would like to especially thank my family, Ema, Josh and Billy, for their patience and support throughout. The dedication and hard work of the whole HDR team, listed earlier, was critical. Among those who provided important strategic advice and suggestions, which were especially critical in pulling the report together, were Oliver Bakewell, Martin Bell, Stephen Castles, Joseph Chamie, Samuel Choritz, Michael Clemens, Simon Commander, Sakiko Fukuda-Parr, Hein de Haas, Frank Laczko, Loren Landau, Manjula Luthria, Gregory Maniatis, Philip Martin, Douglas Massey, Saraswathi Menon, Frances Stewart, Michael Walton and Kevin Watkins.

Background studies were commissioned on a range of thematic issues and published online in our Human Development Research Papers series, launched in April 2009, and are listed in the bibliography. A series of 27 seminars that were held between August 2008 and April 2009 likewise provided important stimulus to our thinking and the development of ideas, and we would again thank those presenters for sharing their research and insights. We would also like to acknowledge the contribution of the national experts who participated in our migration policy assessment.

The data and statistics used in this report draw significantly upon the databases of other organizations to which we were allowed generous access: Andean Development Corporation; Development Research Centre on Migration, University of Sussex; ECLAC; International Migration Institute, Oxford; Inter-Parliamentary Union; Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre; the Department of Statistics and the International Migration Programme of the ILO; IOM; Luxembourg Income Study; OECD; UNICEF; UNDESA, Statistics Division and Population Division; UNESCO Institute for

Statistics; UNHCR; Treaty Section, United Nations Office of Legal Affairs; UNRWA; the World Bank; and WHO.

The report benefited greatly from intellectual advice and guidance provided by an academic advisory panel. The panel comprised Maruja Asis, Richard Black, Caroline Brettell, Stephen Castles, Simon Commander, Jeff Crisp, Priya Deshingkar, Cai Fang, Elizabeth Ferris, Bill Frelick, Sergei Guriev, Gordon Hanson, Ricardo Hausmann, Michele Klein-Solomon, Kishore Mahbubani, Andrew Norman Mold, Kathleen Newland, Yaw Nyarko, José Antonio Ocampo, Gustav Ranis, Bonaventure Rutinwa, Javier Santiso, Maurice Schiff, Frances Stewart, Elizabeth Thomas-Hope, Jeffrey Williamson, Ngaire Woods and Hania Zlotnik.

From the outset, the process involved a range of participatory consultations designed to draw on the expertise of researchers, civil society advocates, development practitioners and policy makers from around the globe. This included 11 informal stakeholder consultations held between August 2008 and April 2009 in Nairobi, New Delhi, Amman, Bratislava, Manila, Sydney, Dakar, Rio de Janeiro, Geneva, Turin and Johannesburg, involving almost 300 experts and practitioners in total. The support of UNDP country and regional offices and local partners was critical in enabling these consultations. Several events were hosted by key partners, including the IOM, the ILO and the Migration Policy Institute. Additional academic consultations took place in Washington D.C. and Princeton, and HDRO staff participated in various other regional and global fora, including the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD) in Manila, preparatory meetings for the Athens GFMD, and many conferences and seminars organized by other UN agencies (e.g. ILO, UNDESA and UNITAR), universities, think-tanks and non-governmental organizations. Participants in a series of Human Development Network discussions provided wide-ranging insights and observations on the linkages between migration and human development. More details on the process are available at <http://hdr.undp.org/en/nhdr>.

A UNDP Readers Group, comprising representatives of all the regional and policy bureaux, provided many useful inputs and suggestions on the concept note and report drafts, as did a number of other colleagues who provided inputs and advice. We would especially thank Amat Alsoswa, Carolina Azevedo, Barbara Barungi, Tony Bislimi, Kim Bolduc, Winifred Byanyima, Ajay Chhibber, Samuel Choritz, Pedro Conceição, Awa Dabo, Georgina Fekete, Priya Gajraj, Enrique Ganuza, Tegegnetwork Gettu, Rebeca Grynspan, Sultan Hajiyev, Mona Hammam, Mette Bloch Hansen, Mari Huseby, Selim Jahan, Bruce Jenks, Arun Kashyap, Olav Kjoren, Paul Ladd, Luis Felipe López-Calva, Tanni Mukhopadhyay, B. Murali, Theodore Murphy, Mihail Peleah, Amin Sharkawi, Kori Udovicki, Mourad Wahba and Caitlin Wiesen for comments.

A team at Green Ink, led by Simon Chater, provided editing services. The design work was carried out by Zago. Guoping Huang developed some of the maps. The production, translation, distribution and promotion of the report benefited from the help and support of the UNDP Office of Communications, and particularly of Maureen Lynch. Translations were reviewed by

Luc Gregoire, Madi Musa, Uladzimir Shcherbau and Oscar Yujnovsky. Margaret Chi and Solaiman Al-Rifai of the United Nations Office for Project Services provided critical administrative support and management services.

The report also benefited from the dedicated work of a number of interns, namely Shreya Basu, Vanessa Alicia Chee, Delphine De Quina, Rebecca Lee Funk, Chloe Yuk Ting Heung, Abid Raza Khan, Alastair Mackay, Grace Parker, Clare Potter, Limon B. Rodriguez, Nicolas Roy, Kristina Shapiro and David Stubbs.

We thank all of those involved directly or indirectly in guiding our efforts, while acknowledging sole responsibility for errors of commission and omission.



Jeni Klugman
Director
Human Development Report 2009

Acronyms

CEDAW	United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CMW	United Nations International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families
CRC	United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
ECD	Early childhood development
ECLAC	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
EIU	Economist Intelligence Unit
EU	European Union
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GDP	Gross domestic product
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
HDI	Human Development Index
HDR	Human Development Report
HDRO	Human Development Report Office
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
MERCOSUR	Mercado Común del Sur (Southern Common Market)
MIPEX	Migrant Integration Policy Index
NGO	Non-governmental organization
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
TMBs	Treaty Monitoring Bodies
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization

Contents

Foreword	v	CHAPTER 4	
Acknowledgements	vii	Impacts at origin and destination	71
Acronyms	ix	4.1 Impacts at places of origin	71
OVERVIEW	1	4.1.1 Household level effects	71
How and why people move	1	4.1.2 Community and national level economic effects	76
Barriers to movement	2	4.1.3 Social and cultural effects	79
The case for mobility	3	4.1.4 Mobility and national development strategies	82
Our proposal	3	4.2 Destination place effects	83
The way forward	5	4.2.1 Aggregate economic impacts	84
CHAPTER 1		4.2.2 Labour market impacts	85
Freedom and movement: how mobility can foster human development	9	4.2.3 Rapid urbanization	86
1.1 Mobility matters	9	4.2.4 Fiscal impacts	87
1.2 Choice and context: understanding why people move	11	4.2.5 Perceptions and concerns about migration	89
1.3 Development, freedom and human mobility	14	4.3 Conclusions	92
1.4 What we bring to the table	16	CHAPTER 5	
CHAPTER 2		Policies to enhance human development outcomes	95
People in motion: who moves where, when and why	21	5.1 The core package	96
2.1 Human movement today	21	5.1.1 Liberalizing and simplifying regular channels	96
2.2 Looking back	28	5.1.2 Ensuring basic rights for migrants	99
2.2.1 The long-term view	28	5.1.3 Reducing transaction costs associated with movement	102
2.2.2 The 20th century	30	5.1.4 Improving outcomes for migrants and destination communities	104
2.3 Policies and movement	33	5.1.5 Enabling benefits from internal mobility	106
2.4 Looking ahead: the crisis and beyond	40	5.1.6 Making mobility an integral part of national development strategies	108
2.4.1 The economic crisis and the prospects for recovery	41	5.2 The political feasibility of reform	108
2.4.2 Demographic trends	43	5.3 Conclusions	112
2.4.3 Environmental factors	45	Notes	113
2.5 Conclusions	46	Bibliography	119
CHAPTER 3		STATISTICAL ANNEX	
How movers fare	49	Tables	143
3.1 Incomes and livelihoods	49	Reader's guide	203
3.1.1 Impacts on gross income	50	Technical note	208
3.1.2 Financial costs of moving	53	Definition of statistical terms and indicators	209
3.2 Health	55	Country classification	213
3.3 Education	57		
3.4 Empowerment, civic rights and participation	60		
3.5 Understanding outcomes from negative drivers	62		
3.5.1 When insecurity drives movement	62		
3.5.2 Development-induced displacement	64		
3.5.3 Human trafficking	65		
3.6 Overall impacts	67		
3.7 Conclusions	68		

BOXES

1.1 Estimating the impact of movement	12
1.2 How movement matters to the measurement of progress	14
1.3 Basic terms used in this report	15
1.4 How do the poor view migration?	16
2.1 Counting irregular migrants	23
2.2 Conflict-induced movement and trafficking	26
2.3 Migration trends in the former Soviet Union	31
2.4 Global governance of mobility	39
3.1 China: Policies and outcomes associated with internal migration	52
3.2 Independent child migrants	59
3.3 The next generation	60
3.4 Enforcement mechanisms in Malaysia	62
4.1 How cell-phones can reduce money transfer costs: the case of Kenya	74
4.2 The 2009 crisis and remittances	75
4.3 Impacts of skills flows on human development	77
4.4 Mobility and the development prospects of small states	80
4.5 Mobility and human development: some developing country perspectives	82
5.1 Opening up regular channels—Sweden and New Zealand	97
5.2 Experience with regularization	98
5.3 Reducing paperwork: a challenge for governments and partners	103
5.4 Recognition of credentials	105
5.5 When skilled people emigrate: some policy options	109

FIGURES

2.1 Many more people move within borders than across them: Internal movement and emigration rates, 2000–2002	22
2.2 The poorest have the most to gain from moving... Differences between destination and origin country HDI, 2000–2002	23
2.3 ... but they also move less: Emigration rates by HDI and income	25
2.4 An increasing share of migrants come from developing countries: Share of migrants from developing countries in selected developed countries	32
2.5 Sources and trends of migration into developing countries: Migrants as a share of total population in selected countries, 1960–2000s	33
2.6 Internal migration rates have increased only slightly: Trends in lifetime internal migration intensity in selected countries, 1960–2000s	34
2.7 Global income gaps have widened: Trends in real per capita GDP, 1960–2007	35
2.8 Welcome the high-skilled, rotate the low-skilled: Openness to legal immigration in developed versus developing countries, 2009	36
2.9 Enforcement practices vary: Interventions and procedures regarding irregular migrants, 2009	37
2.10 Cross-country evidence shows little support for the 'numbers versus rights' hypothesis: Correlations between access and treatment	38
2.11 Unemployment is increasing in key migrant destinations: Unemployment rates in selected destinations, 2007–2010	41
2.12 Migrants are in places hardest hit by the recession: Immigrants' location and projected GDP growth rates, 2009	42

2.13 Working-age population will increase in developing regions: Projections of working-age population by region, 2010–2050	44
3.1 Movers have much higher incomes than stayers: Annual income of migrants in OECD destination countries and GDP per capita in origin countries, by origin country HDI category	50
3.2 Huge salary gains for high-skilled movers: Gaps in average professional salaries for selected country pairs, 2002–2006	50
3.3 Significant wage gains to internal movers in Bolivia, especially the less well educated: Ratio of destination to origin wages for internal migrants in Bolivia, 2000	51
3.4 Poverty is higher among migrant children, but social transfers can help: Effects of transfers on child poverty in selected countries, 1999–2001	53
3.5 Costs of moving are often high: Costs of intermediaries in selected corridors against income per capita, 2006–2008	54
3.6 Moving costs can be many times expected monthly earnings: Costs of movement against expected salary of low-skilled Indonesian workers in selected destinations, 2008	54
3.7 The children of movers have a much greater chance of surviving: Child mortality at origin versus destination by origin country HDI category, 2000 census or latest round	55
3.8 Temporary and irregular migrants often lack access to health care services: Access to health care by migrant status in developed versus developing countries, 2009	57
3.9 Gains in schooling are greatest for migrants from low-HDI countries: Gross total enrolment ratio at origin versus destination by origin country HDI category, 2000 census or latest round	58
3.10 Migrants have better access to education in developed countries: Access to public schooling by migrant status in developed versus developing countries, 2009	58
3.11 Voting rights are generally reserved for citizens: Voting rights in local elections by migrant status in developed versus developing countries, 2009	61
3.12 School enrolment among refugees often exceeds that of host communities in developing countries: Gross primary enrolment ratios—refugees, host populations and main countries of origin, 2007	64
3.13 Significant human development gains to internal movers: Ratio of migrants' to non-migrants' estimated HDI in selected developing countries, 1995–2005	67
3.14 Migrants are generally as happy as locally-born people: Self-reported happiness among migrants and locally-born people around the world, 2005/2006	68
4.1 The global recession is expected to impact remittance flows: Projected trends in remittance flows to developing regions, 2006–2011	75
4.2 Skilled workers move similarly across and within nations: Population and share of skilled workers who migrate internally and internationally	78
4.3 Support for immigration is contingent on job availability: Attitudes towards immigration and availability of jobs, 2005/2006	90
4.4 When jobs are limited, people favour the locally born: Public opinion about job preferences by destination country HDI category, 2005/2006	91
4.5 Many people value ethnic diversity: Popular views about the value of ethnic diversity by destination country HDI category, 2005/2006	92

5.1 Ratification of migrants' rights convention has been limited: Ratification of selected agreements by HDI category, as of 2009	100
5.2 Support for opportunity to stay permanently: Preferences for temporary versus permanent migration, 2008	110

MAPS

1.1 Borders matter: HDI in United States and Mexican border localities, 2000	10
1.2 Migrants are moving to places with greater opportunities: Human development and inter-provincial migration flows in China, 1995–2000	11
2.1 Most movement occurs within regions: Origin and destination of international migrants, circa 2000	24
3.1 Conflict as a driver of movement in Africa: Conflict, instability and population movement in Africa	63
4.1 Remittances flow primarily from developed to developing regions: Flows of international remittances, 2006–2007	73

TABLES

2.1 Five decades of aggregate stability, with regional shifts: Regional distribution of international migrants, 1960–2010	30
2.2 Policy makers say they are trying to maintain existing immigration levels: Views and policies towards immigration by HDI category, 2007	34
2.3 Over a third of countries significantly restrict the right to move: Restrictions on internal movement and emigration by HDI category	40
2.4 Dependency ratios to rise in developed countries and remain steady in developing countries: Dependency ratio forecasts of developed versus developing countries, 2010–2050	45
4.1 PRSs recognize the multiple impacts of migration: Policy measures aimed at international migration in PRSs, 2000–2008	83

STATISTICAL ANNEX TABLES

A Human movement: snapshots and trends	143
B International emigrants by area of residence	147
C Education and employment of international migrants in OECD countries (aged 15 years and above)	151
D Conflict and insecurity-induced movement	155
E International financial flows: remittances, official development assistance and foreign direct investment	159
F Selected conventions related to human rights and migration (by year of ratification)	163
G Human development index trends	167
H Human development index 2007 and its components	171
I ¹ Human and income poverty	176
I ² Human and income poverty: OECD countries	180
J Gender-related development index and its components	181
K Gender empowerment measure and its components	186
L Demographic trends	191
M Economy and inequality	195
N Health and education	199